

Yes, it can be said that the bureaucracy has let India down, admits State Principal Secretary Sumit Mullick

Mr. Sumit Mullick, Principal Secretary and Public Relations Officer of the Maharashtra government, admitted at the last meeting that although India had seen a lot of development over the last 63 years, there had been nothing spectacular about its progress.

On the contrary, he virtually admitted that thanks to skewed priorities and adoption of the wrong model of development, India had missed opportunities and lagged behind those countries that had attained Independence a few years after this country became free.

He was speaking on a thought-provoking subject, "Should the Indian bureaucracy be treated at par with global warming and HIV/AIDS?" and made no bones about the country's failure in reducing poverty, improving sanitation, educating the poor masses and giving them the chance to live longer and to lead a better life.

Nandan Maluste, who introduced the speaker, pointed out that Mr. Mullick topped the B.A. and M.A. exams (in history) at the University of Calcutta and joined the Indian Administrative Service (IAS) in the early 1980s when he was assigned to the Maharashtra cadre. He had gone on to serve the State in every possible capacity.

Mr. Mullick said at the outset that the title of his talk was based on an article in *The Economist* which stated that "the Indian bureaucracy should be treated at par with global warming or HIV/AIDS – which means that the Indian bureaucracy should be treated as a global disaster".

He had found the sentence to be provocative and felt angry and indignant, considering that he had put in 28 years in the IAS. However, a quick glance at some statistics had made him see the reality. These pertained to the human development index, life expectancy, infant and maternal mortality and so on. Most of these served to drag down the world averages rather than raising them.

In the bargain, the Indian bureaucracy had, "to put it very mildly, not succeeded" in carrying out the task



It's true that India missed the development bus, admits Mr. Sumit Mullick, Principal Secretary and Public Relations Officer of the Maharashtra government, at the last meeting while speaking on 'Should the Indian bureaucracy be treated at par with global warming and HIV/AIDS?'

assigned to it under the directive principles of the Indian Constitution, viz., providing the people with livelihood, education, health and so on. But he was loyal to his tribe, the IAS, which had done several good things, too.

Tracing the history of the IAS, Mr. Mullick said that it was the successor of the Indian Civil Service (ICS) which was modelled on the lines of the administrative system of Sher Shah Suri. The ICS had barely 350 officers from England who formed the steel backbone of the administration and ruled India for 90 years – from 1857 to 1947.

The ICS had kept the country together and so had the IAS. This was a noteworthy achievement because at the time of Independence many people, including Winston Churchill, had said that India would never remain united and that the people would go for each other's throats if they were given independence.

"We (the IAS) kept the country united, we prevented total anarchy... yes (some people say that India is), a functional anarchy, but there is no total anarchy. We prevented civil war and we prevented mass famines. Famines were a regular feature of Indian life before Independence. We also prevented major epidemics. Therefore, let me say that things are not all that bad. Having said that, let us continue from there."

Picking up one of the most important features of the Human Development Index (HDI), life expectancy at birth, Mr. Mullick said the figure was 64.4 years for India, whereas in developed countries it was 80 years. This meant that the average Indian did not live his entire natural life span. He lived 20% less.

For a population of 1.20 billion, this meant that 30 million people were unnecessarily dying every year. They could have lived to be 80, but passed away at 64 years.

Returning to his point that the IAS had helped prevent famines, the speaker recalled that Prof. Amartya Sen, the Nobel Laureate, had said that democracies never tolerated famines because they attracted a lot of attention, from legislators, from the media and so on. Famines were dramatic events, making for gripping reportage.

"But 30 million people dying every year – slowly, quietly, in their huts, in their houses, that's not dramatic! And a democracy can tolerate that! That's one statistic I would like to leave you with – about 30 million people die annually before their time."

Mr. Mullick said that life expectancy at birth was not a factor of wealth alone. Bangladesh had a lower per capita income than India but life expectancy was higher (at 66.9%). Life

expectancy in Kerala was 76%. But then Kerala was a different story even though it was not a rich State. (The life expectancy in 32 leading nations of the world was 80 years.)

What about the maternal mortality rate (MMR)? In India it was 450 per 100,000 live births, in Pakistan it was 320. In developed countries it was supposed to be between three and six per 100,000 live births.

"This is a horrifying, shameful statistic. A birth should be a joyous occasion, but often it turns into a tragedy."

Turning to sanitation, Mr. Mullick said that apart from aesthetics, it contributed tremendously to disease, ill-health, death and loss of productivity. It was estimated that because of lack of sanitation the country lost about \$40 billion a year.

(Continued on Page 2)

Forthcoming meetings

April 5, 2011

Dr. Shrirang Joshi to address the Club.

April 12, 2011

Public Holiday. There will be no meeting.

April 19, 2011

"Secrets of the Mahabharata," a talk by Mr. Devdutt Patnaik.

'Experts have been saying since Independence that India will prosper only if the population is healthy and literate'

(Continued from Page 1)

In India, 69% of people had no access to sanitation. This, too, was not a factor of wealth or per capita incomes. Poorer countries had better sanitation. In Bangladesh, 47% of people had no access to sanitation, in Swaziland 45% and in Pakistan 55%. In Vietnam, only 25% had no access to sanitation.

On a visit to Bangladesh with a World Bank team, he had noted that a tremendous amount of work had been done in this area. The government spent nothing on constructing toilets; it made the villagers spend for themselves. Government only educated the villagers about the ill-effects of open defecation and so on. And the programme seemed to be working very well.

But in India a totally different model was followed; here, the government spent a lot of money to build toilets. Mr. Mullick recalled that when he was District Magistrate and Divisional Commissioner, the government spent about Rs. 8,000 per person to build toilets.

"In a hut made of mud, you construct one room, a toilet; but this is the only pucca room in the house. It is the best room in the house – so the householder doesn't use it as a toilet, he uses it as a temple or as a storehouse! Bangladesh spent no money and saw to it that more than half the population had access to sanitation.

"There is also the cultural factor. There are various parts of India (such as the Konkan and Bengal) where there is no open defecation. But in most parts of our hinterland open defecation is almost socially acceptable. It is a sort of 'social event', when people get together and download."

Mr. Mullick said the same story was repeated in the field of education; poorer countries had better literacy rates. Kerala had a literacy rate of over

90%, while the rate for India was 66%. But Sudan had 69%, Cambodia 77% and Vietnam 92.5% literacy.

And this was in spite of the fact that experts had been saying right since Independence that the country would prosper economically only if the population was made literate and remained healthy.

Following India's Independence in 1947, many other countries also won their freedom. These included Taiwan, Malaysia, Indonesia, South Korea, China and so on. But those countries followed the model that gave mass education and mass universal health care to all. They believed that if they had a healthy, literate population, they would be able to invite the world to invest capital in their countries and offered to make all kinds of products for them at the cheapest rates.

India, sadly, could never attain universal literacy, admitted Mr. Mullick.

"Even the figure of 66% literacy in India is highly suspicious. I've done a lot of work in education since I served as District Magistrate in Sangli. There, in the mid-1990s, we started an adult literacy programme. This was a government of India programme under which all adult illiterates in the age group of 15 to 35 were to be made literate. We took the help of a number of volunteers, college students, professors and so on, and managed to make 1.35 lakh adults literate.

"But in the process I came to know that a lot of those adult illiterates had actually been to school. Some had been in school up to Class V or even Class VII. But they still could not write their names, could not understand alphabets, numerals and so on. They went to school, but they did not get educated. So I decided to find out what was happening in primary schools. I went to Amravati and toured four or five districts as Divisional Commis-

sioner. We did a 100% baseline survey of 600,000 students.

"And we ultimately found that the actual literacy is only 18% in schools. This means that 82% of children passing out of schools are either illiterate or semi-literate. There are no exams, so the teacher passes everyone. Later, they do their board exams, cheat their way through them and then sit for the D.Ed. (Diploma in Education) which is the qualification to become a teacher. So they become teachers – but they are still semi-literate! It has become a vicious cycle."

Mr. Mullick said this system had done tremendous damage to the country which now lacked skilled talent. Generally, it was accepted that only 25% of all graduates were employable. Another 25% could become employable with rigorous training. But 50% would remain unemployable. And it all started from primary education.

Therefore, the literacy rate of 66% was "highly suspicious... it is much, much lower than that". One reason for this could be the fact that while the ideal spend on education was 6% of GDP, India spent only 3.2%.

Returning to the issue of health, Mr. Mullick said that the health expenditure as a percentage of GDP was shamefully low. It was only 1.1% in India, whereas it was 3.5% in Mongolia, 3.6% in South Africa, 7.2% in Guyana and 6% in most developed countries.

Of all the large countries with a population of over 100 million, India spent the least with the exception of Bangladesh.

Mr. Mullick blamed the rich and the upper middle class for this situation, stating that the government was "trapped" by these sections of society. They had access to government and were also able to put pressure on it (they also controlled the media) since they only went to private institutions for health and education. The poor and the lower middle class were forced to deal with poor quality public health and public education.

"They (the poor and the lower middle class) can't lobby, they don't have the time, the energy and the access to government, so they get neglected."

What about the per capita expenditure on health? In India, which only spent 1.1% of its GDP on health, the expenditure per person on health was \$109. In Swaziland it was \$287, in Namibia \$467 and in the USA \$7,285. Many countries lacked the resources but understood the value of health and so spent much more than India.

One of the worst consequences of insufficient public financing and lack of infrastructure was the high infant mortality rate. The infant mortality rate per 1,000 for those below 5 was 69 in India; it was 64 in Bangladesh and 19 in Vietnam. Vietnam had a lower per capita income than India and was still emerging from a long, horrifying war.

Mr. Mullick then turned to poverty rates which, he said, were an example of how Indian statistics dragged down the world averages. There were a total of 1.70 billion poor people in the world. Of these, 25% or 410 million poor people lived in India.

Of course, there were variations within India, too, with Bihar reporting 80% poverty and Kerala a mere 16%. And it was not fair to blame the bureaucracy for this because the same IAS officers served all over the country, whether in Bihar or in Kerala. How come they had been able to show results in Kerala but not in Bihar?

Clearly, it depended on several socio-economic factors, on tradition, the political leadership and so on. Thankfully, Bihar, which used to be one of the best administered States in the 1950s and before Independence, had now started recovering.

On the multi-dimensional poverty index, computed on the basis of the availability of a number of variables (such as energy, electricity, nutrition, sanitation and so on), India was at the 73rd place out of 103 nations. Even Bangladesh (ranked 72) and Pakistan (69) fared better than India.

"We know about most of these things, we read about them in the papers. But we have to keep reminding ourselves about them as we try to become a superpower, as we try to get a seat on the UN Security Council. We have to keep reminding ourselves that we have a big problem within our country."

Mr. Mullick then turned to corruption, which he called "the hot topic of the day". As per Transparency International, India stood at number 87 out of 178 countries. "We can feel happy that there are at least 90 countries that are more corrupt than us!"

On a more serious note, he said, in the course of his activities as one who looked after foreign investments (for Maharashtra), he had observed that corruption affected investment. The State had received less investment compared to previous years after the emergence of scams pertaining to 2G spectrum, Commonwealth Games and so on. China received four times more investment.

(Continued on Page 6)



With the guest speaker and his pretty spouse. Snapped with Mr. Sumit and Mrs. Tanuja Mullick are (from right) Mudit Jain, S.K. Mitra and PP Ashish Vaid



Deepak Parekh runs the extra mile, nets Rs. 16 lakhs for 'Bhavishya-Yaan'

The Club's Honorary member, Mr. Deepak Parekh, had said while addressing the Club last year that each Rotarian should contribute his/her mite towards raising funds for the various projects that it undertakes.

And in January this year, he walked the talk, literally.

Along with a large group of colleagues from M/s HDFC Ltd., Mr. Deepak Parekh took part in the *Standard Chartered Mumbai Marathon* to help raise funds for *Bhavishya-Yaan*, the highly acclaimed education project of the Club.

When the numbers finally came in last week, they were printed on a cheque – and this was a cheque for Rs. 15.90 lakhs.

Members will recall that when *Bhavishya-Yaan* was a fledgling project, HDFC had stepped up to the plate and donated all the

computers required for the computer room at the Colaba Municipal School.

Vice-President Nowroze Vazifdar informed members at the last meeting about the receipt of the cheque and thanked Mr. Deepak Parekh and his team for walking the talk or, as the Americans put it, for “putting his money where his mouth is”.

Birthday donation

Vice-President Nowroze Vazifdar informed members at the last meeting that a birthday donation of Rs. 10,000 had been received from Devendra Kothari.

At the last meeting

(Held on March 29, 2011)

VICE-PRESIDENT Nowroze Vazifdar called the meeting to order and welcomed the guest speaker, the Visiting Rotarians, Rotaryans, guests and others.

BIRTHDAYS

Members and spouses celebrating their birthday during the week were felicitated.

ATTENDANCE

Members	98
Visiting Rotarians	2
Spouses/Rotaryans	3
Total	103
Svc. box collection	Rs. 4,250

The Club's Honorary member, Mr. Deepak Parekh, has been instrumental in garnering Rs. 15.90 lakhs for the 'Bhavishya-Yaan' project through his team's participation in the 'Standard Chartered Mumbai Marathon' in January this year

Malti Jain donates music system

According to information just received, Rotaryann Malti Jain has donated a music system to the *Bhavishya-Yaan* project. This system will be used for students of the *Bhavishya-Yaan* project being conducted at the Dr. Ambedkar Municipal School at Worli.

Information sought for the new Club Roster

Hon. Secretary Bipin Kapadia has appealed to members to send updated information about themselves for use in the new Club Roster proposed to be brought out soon.

He has requested members to refer to their respective copies of the existing Roster to check whether the information provided therein required any change or correction.

Along with the latest information, members are also requested to send two copies of their latest colour photographs for use in the Roster.

President Pradeep Saxena has also requested members to send their latest photographs for the Club Roster which is likely to be published by the end of the current Rotary year.



The Principal Secretary and his better half. Mr. Sumit Mullick, Principal Secretary and Public Relations Officer of the Maharashtra government, was the guest speaker at the last meeting. While he interacts with PP Gul Kripalani, his spouse, Mrs. Tanuja, chats with Pankaj Baliga



Here are the water babies. These are some of the prize winners at the annual swimming competition for S.E.C. and S.R.C.C. schools sponsored by the Inner Wheel Club of Bombay at the YMCA swimming pool, Agripada. At right are Malti Jain, President Geeta Kapur, Zarine Chothia, Rashna Cooper and Roopal Thakkar



It can help save premature babies. From left at the installation of the 'Bubble C-Pap' equipment at Sion Hospital are District Inner Wheel Chair Indira Kotak, Geeta, IWC Association President Dr. Kapila Gupta, Malti and PP Jyoti Doshi

The Inner Wheel Club of Bombay executes a series of projects

President Geeta Kapur and her colleagues in the Inner Wheel Club of Bombay have been extremely busy during the current Rotary year. Under her leadership the Club has successfully executed a series of significant projects.

These projects encompassed a range of activities and have touched the lives of the have-nots in cities and in villages; they have dealt with fresh water plants and swimming pools;

the physically challenged and the deaf-mutes; as also the urban poor seeking treatment for premature babies in public hospitals.

One of the key projects was the inauguration of a drinking water supply scheme at Shiravali Thakurpada village in Panvel district.

This consists of a bore well from which water is drawn up, pumped to an overhead tank and thereon to the residents through community taps.

The scheme was declared open by District Inner Wheel Chairperson Indira Kotak.

Around the same time, the Inner Wheel Club sponsored the annual swimming competition for the students of the S.E.C. and S.R.C.C. schools at the YMCA swimming pool, Agripada.

Eighty children from three different schools participated in the swimming contest which has now become an eagerly-awaited event.

Thanks to a generous donation by PP Jyoti Doshi, the Inner Wheel Club installed a sophisticated "Bubble C-Pap" machine in the neonatal ward of the Sion Hospital. The equipment is described as life-saving equipment for premature babies.

District Inner Wheel Chairperson Indira Kotak was present at the formal installation of this machine.

Finally, the Inner Wheel Club sponsored the annual sports day at the Institute for the Deaf & Mute, Mazgaon, on February 28. One hundred and forty students participated in various group and individual contests that were organised on the occasion.

The sports meet was attended by President Geeta Kapur, Hon. Secretary Sweta Vakil and Malti Jain. They conducted the prize distribution programme at the end of the event.

Well done, Inner Wheel! Keep it up, Geeta!



Never mind the weight on their heads. Don't the smiles on their faces reveal the state of their mind? District Inner Wheel Chair Indira Kotak, President Geeta, PP Raksha Mehta, PP Falguni Mehta, Rupali Sen and Sadhana Jain share the joy of the women of Shiravali Thakurpada village, Panvel, at the inauguration of the fresh water project



Did somebody say that they are handicapped, or that they are 'challenged' in some way or another? Not these children. The Inner Wheel Club sponsored the annual sports day of the Institute for the Deaf & Mute, Mazgaon. Malti Jain squats with a group of children at left. At right she joins Hon. Secretary Sweta Vakil and Geeta as they distribute prizes



New member Freyaz Shroff is formally inducted

Freyaz Shroff is the newest member of the Rotary Club of Bombay. She was formally inducted at the last meeting by Vice-President Nowroze Vazifdar who conducted the meeting in the absence of President Pradeep Saxena and President-Elect Paul George.

Loaned the Classification "Consultant: Corporate Management", she was introduced by PP Kalpana Munshi.

Kalpana said that Freyaz could best be described as a diehard social worker for whom no cause was too small or too big. She believed that every act of social service started a ripple which turned into a big wave that benefited both the donor as well as the receiver.

A founding student member of Next Century Schools, she had been associated with several voluntary sectors, including funding for deserving students, mentoring programmes, teaching street children English and leadership programmes.

Freyaz obtained an International Language Degree in Spanish from Berlitz International Language School at West Palm Beach in Florida; a Master of Business Administration degree in Management from Winthrop University in Rock Hill; and a Bachelor of Arts degree in Sociology from Furman University in Greenville.



A bouquet for the new member. PP Kalpana Munshi, who introduced her to the Club, welcomes new member Freyaz Shroff with flowers in the first picture and with the Rotary lapel pin in the second. Freyaz was formally inducted at the last meeting of the Rotary Club of Bombay

She had won many awards in various categories such as outstanding community service, manager of the year, senior order academic and leadership awards and the student of the year award for Harry Comity school systems.

With experience in the areas of risk and return, profitability measurement and design, internal audit and corporate development, she had led projects to facilitate mergers and acquisitions in India for UK clients.

Actively involved in various service programmes such as helping victims of domestic violence, setting up youth education programmes and teaching English, Freyaz had developed and designed the English grammar curriculum for Std. VIII and Std. IX for "Akansha", the NGO.

Kalpana added that Freyaz was single and that her firm was called Kur Niv Success Solutions.

Following the introduction, Vice-President Nowroze conducted the for-

mal induction ceremony, which included presenting the new member with a Rotary lapel pin, a Club Roster, Four-Way Test placards and other Rotary literature.

He announced that during the current Rotary year Freyaz would serve on the Club's projects for education, such as *Bhavishya-Yaan*, Merit-cum-Means Scholarships and Rotary Suraksha Loan Scholarships.

Welcome to the Rotary Club of Bombay, Freyaz.

Two workshops – one on teamwork and conflict management; another on domestic violence

Chairperson Poonam Lalvani and the Committee for Women's Empowerment organised two programmes recently for members of various Self-Help Groups (SHGs) sponsored by the RCCs at Jogeshwari and Wadala.

About 50 members of the Jogeshwari SHG attended a work-

shop on "Teamwork and Conflict Management" at Kokan Nagar.

Ms Shilpa from the "Life Trust" was the resource person for this workshop which was held from 4 to 5.30 pm on Friday, March 18.

The resource person, Ms Shilpa, covered various aspects of team-

work, such as group laws, decision-making and conflict management. She urged the participants to remain united because that alone would give them strength.

The participants were totally absorbed in the proceedings, which included an open discussion and a few

educational games. They found the information provided to them to be both useful and informative and said they would apply it while working within their group.

A few days prior to this, Poonam's Committee arranged an awareness programme on domestic violence for SHG members and others at the Sewree RCC (when certificates were distributed by the RCC Committee to several newly-trained beauticians.

Mr. Doiphode and Ms Muskan, both from the "Life Trust", provided important information on domestic violence to the SHG members and to the newly-trained beauticians.

Not only were the participants provided with information on domestic violence, they were also told about salient features of the Domestic Violence Act. They were asked to pass on information about the same to their friends, neighbours, family members and others. They also took part in the informative question-answer session at the end of the workshop.

Mr. Narayan Sawant, the social worker, coordinated both workshops.



You will achieve very little if you do not believe in teamwork. Ms Shilpa (right) representing the 'Life Trust' and resource person for the workshop on 'Teamwork and Conflict Management', addresses members of Self-Help Groups sponsored by the Jogeshwari RCC

SUMIT MULLICK EXPLAINS HOW SUBSIDIES FOR THE POOR ACTUALLY MAKE THEM POORER

(Continued from Page 2)

Further, according to *The Economist*, people were happy to pay (bribe money) in China because they had to pay to just one person, the head honcho, and the work got done. In India there was no such guarantee. Here, everyone wanted a slice of the pie; there were multiple political parties, multiple officials and everyone was on the take. They took money and sometimes did nothing.

However, Mr. Mullick felt that as far as corruption was concerned, things had reached the nadir, the limit, and henceforth things would only get better. Although this was not visible at present, the fact was that society was becoming more aware, the media more aggressive, the Right to Information Act (RTI) was in place and the Lokpal Bill on the anvil.

The advent of new technology was also playing a role. Thanks to computerisation, few people had to pay bribes for railway reservations. Similarly, UID (a unique identity for every citizen) would soon become operational and give everyone a number and secure biometrics. This would stop leakages and help start experiments in transferring money directly to the poor.

"We must appreciate that it is not that the government is not concerned about the poor. It spends 14% of the GDP on subsidies meant for the poor; these subsidies are for power, for food, water, education and so on.

"But these subsidies don't actually reach the poor. A lot of vested interests have arisen around them. In fact, many of these subsidies make the poor poorer. It may sound odd, but I will give you some examples to explain this."

Mr. Mullick then described how the public distribution system for food grains and other essentials actually

forced the poor holder of a ration card to buy his needs at very high prices from the open market.

While serving in Amravati, he had noticed that the poor had ration cards and could pick their 30 kg. of food grain and their quota of kerosene from the ration shop. Thanks to the subsidies, there was a tremendous differential between the market price and the price of subsidised food grains.

On account of this, the "market forces" drove the subsidised food grains and the subsidised kerosene into the open market, leaving no stocks in the fair price shops.

When a poor person went to a fair price shop, he found that there were no grains there. This forced him to buy from the open market. But the market price had already gone up because the Food Corporation of India (FCI) had been buying up all food grains from the market in the name of the poor.

Thus, the food prices went up and stayed up and the poor person had to depend on the open market to buy food, which cost a lot more because of the purchases being made by the FCI.

Mr. Mullick gave the example of free electricity to farmers to explain how the subsidies in this area also worked against the poor farmer.

The rich farmer had more than one bore well, whereas the poor farmer had only one well, which was a dug well without a pump. The rich farmer sucked out all the water from the soil and the poor farmer's single dug well turned dry. The rich farmer continued using his pumps because the electricity was free. He did not have to pay the bill for electricity that he received, thanks to the political support available to him.

It was the poor farmer who suffered in all this; his single well turned dry because the rich farmer in his

neighbourhood took away all the water with the help of the free electricity that was actually meant for poor farmers. Thus, subsidies actually made the poor poorer.

But the tide appeared to have turned towards direct cash transfers to the poor with the help of UID and biometric devices. Some models were being worked on to ensure that all cash transfers were made without leakages. Considering that 14% of GDP was being spent on subsidies for the poor, the new approach could make a huge difference.

Finally, Mr. Mullick said that he remained optimistic about the future. The task ahead was enormous but there was no point in depending on the bureaucracy alone.

"The bureaucracy has its limitations; it has to work within a political system – and politicians have their own targets. It is actually a job for civil society... If civil society, corporates (under CSR) and the government get together, I think the country can eventually (unless there is some major disaster in between) become the superpower that it wants to be."

Mr. Mullick was then ready to field questions.

The first one was asked by Mudit Jain who noted that although India was loaded with talent, it remained backward. In fact, he felt that India could call people from the rest of the world to come here and learn how not to run a country!

Stating that he could not possibly call the government "useless" (considering that he was a government servant), Mr. Mullick said it would be apparent that the country had made a lot of progress if one compared the present situation with the statistics of one or two decades earlier. India could have moved faster, but...

"We have the resources, we have the talent; we have yoga, we have ability; our talents are recognised all over the world. We can do it, which is the reason why I wanted to shock you with these statistics, showing that things are bad; but I don't want you to go with the impression that they can't improve. Things will improve, but I am worried about the speed."

Mayank Kummur reminded Mr. Mullick that he had started by saying that the IAS was modelled on the ICS which was meant to rule India. But the IAS was supposed to be public servants – not to rule but to serve India. "If the concept behind the IAS remains the same as the concept that was behind the ICS, then isn't that a fundamental flaw?"

"You point is well taken," said Mr. Mullick. "Nehru had said that the ICS was neither Indian, nor Civil or Service. He wanted to abolish the ICS. But it was Sardar Patel who felt that it was necessary to have one central service which will serve as the backbone for the country. I am a Bengali operating in Maharashtra. My colleague from Maharashtra may be operating in Kashmir; and a Kashmiri might be in south India. This is the steel frame.

"During the ICS days, their basic role was to maintain law and order and to collect revenue. We have added a third component, development, which takes care of the service factor. Development has not been as effective as it should have been, probably because we are still stuck in the ICS mode and we still consider ourselves to be masters. Service orientation has still not developed to the extent that it should have... and that is accepted. But there is a change.

"We have to implement Acts like the IPC, the CrPC and so on which were made with the idea of suppressing the natives; those Acts are still there. One argument is that the white masters have been replaced by brown masters but things remain the same. But that's a very cynical way of looking at things; otherwise, the country would not have made the substantial progress that it has made."

Mr. Mullick admitted that India could have done much better in far less time as had those countries in south-east Asia and in east Asia that had become independent around the same time.

It was then the turn of Prof. Rohini Chowgule to take on the State's Principal Secretary on what she called the simple issue of eradicating tuberculosis through improved sanitation. The highest number of patients with tuberculosis lived in India.

(Continued on Page 8)



Thank you for addressing our Club. Vice-President Nowroze Vazifdar presents a memento to Mr. Sumit Mullick, the guest speaker at the last meeting. At right is Priyasri Patodia who proposed the vote of thanks (part of it in Bengali) April 5 to April 11, 2011



The root of
today's enterprise.



Binani Metals Limited: Marcantile Chambers, 12 J.N. Herdia Marg, Ballard Estate, Mumbai- 400 001.
Tel: 2261 7491 Fax: 2261 9577 Email: contact@binanimetals.co.in

Binani
BRAJ BINANI GROUP

ROTARY CLUB OF BOMBAY

FOUNDED 19 MARCH, 1929
 Charter No. 3128, Dated 08 May, 1929
 97-B, Mittal Tower, Nariman Point,
 Mumbai 400 021, INDIA
 Tel.: +91-22-2202 4089
 Fax.: +91-22-2202 4509
 rc_bombay@rediffmail.com
OFFICE-BEARERS 2010/11

PRESIDENT	PRADEEP SAXENA
Imm. Past President	Nandan Damani
President-Elect	Paul George
Vice-President	Nowroze Vazifdar
Honorary Secretary	Bipin Kapadia
Joint Hon. Secretary	Sitaram Shah
Hon. Treasurer	Ishraq Contractor
DIRECTORS	
Vineet Bhatnagar	Roda Billimoria
Suresh Goklaney	Shailesh Haribhakti
Shivkumar Israni	Arin Master
S.K. Mitra	Ramesh Narayan
CLUB SERVICE - New Members	
Director	Paul George
Classifications	PP Ashish Vaid
Membership	PP Dr. Adi Dastur
Member. Dev. & DisCon	Nowroze Vazifdar
Information	PP Dr. Kekoo Kavarana
Mentoring & Assimilation	PP Sandip Agarwalla
CLUB SERVICE - Programmes/Meetings	
Director	Ramesh Narayan
Fellowship	Shernaz Vakil
Sports	Moy Biswas
Programme	Dolly Thakore
Sergeant-at-Arms	Pradeep Gujarathi
Attendance	Arvind Agarwal
Bulletin & Website	PP Arun Sanghi
Public Relations	Priyasri Patodia
COMMUNITY SERVICE - Medical	
Director	Arin Master
Chairman Emeritus,	
Talwada	PP Dr. Rahim Muljani
HTEC, Talwada	PP Dr. Rumi Jehangir
ADMC, Talwada	Dr. Mitul Patel
Oral Health	Dr. Sorab Javeri
Control of TB	Prof. Rohini Chowgule
Hepatitis & Polio Immu.	Dr. Vandana Bulchandani
Cancer Aid	Zinia Lawyer
COMMUNITY SERVICE - Non-Medical	
Director	Suresh Goklaney
RCC	Shyamniwas Somani
Global Warming/ Green Vision	Jagdish Malkani
Old Age Homes/ Senior Citizens	Naresh Kumar Jain
Women Empowerment	Poonam Lalvani
Rural Development	Dilnavaz Variava
Water Management	Ramesh Dhir
VOCATIONAL SERVICE	
Director	S.K. Mitra
Rotary & Public Awards	Nelum Gidwani
Promotion of Arts, Music & Dance	Sabira Merchant
Four-Way Test	Manoj Kumar Patodia
INTERNATIONAL SERVICE	
Director	Shailesh Haribhakti
R.I. Programmes	PP Rajnikant Reshamwala
Rotary Foundation/ Matching Grants	PP Arvind Jolly
Fund-Raising	Ashok Minawala
NEW GENERATIONS - Education	
Director	Vineet Bhatnagar
Education for All	Alok Sekhsaria
Rotary Suraksha Loans	Ashok Jatia
Merit-cum-Means Scholarships	Madhusudan Daga
Management Studies	Poonam Kumar
Legal Case Practice	Apurva Diwanji
NEW GENERATIONS - Youth	
Director	Roda Billimoria
Interact	Arjun Jolly
Rotaract	Mehul Sampat
Night Study Centres	Sunny Pariyaram
Vocational Train. Centres	Jacob Abraham
Road Safety	Deepak Kapadia
DISTRICT THRUST PROJECTS	
Director	Shivkumar Israni
Differently-abled	PP Kalpana Munshi
Disha	Subash Gogia
Rural Lighting	Kiran Nanda
Adoption of Police Station	Nirav Shah

'After Independence India adopted the wrong policy of socialism'

(Continued from Page 6)

"Other countries have eradicated tuberculosis simply by improving sanitation. Why is India lagging? Why haven't we spent time and money on improving sanitation in the whole country? It's such a simple thing. We have not even been able to give clean water to rural areas for the last 60 years. Why are we taking so long?"

Mr. Mullick said India had got its policies wrong. It had adopted an expensive model, opting for capital expenditure rather than spending on education, sanitation, communication and so on.

The policy of building toilets at a cost of Rs. 8,000 each meant that it covered only a dozen or so houses in a village. But unless the whole village is sanitised it serves no purpose, because even one person defecating in the open can spread disease.

"That model was wrong and it has changed. We have stopped the heavy subsidies and are more into education; hopefully, that will have a better impact. There is also the cultural factor and we have to understand it. For many people, open defecation is not an issue."

Rohini insisted that if policies were wrong, it was necessary to change them. No industry could continue for

60 years if it followed bad policies. "At least in the last five years you could have done something."

She added that just as the National TB programme had failed, even the current DOTS campaign was not doing well. "We are still following the same principles, the same approaches... also, corruption. Why can't we learn from past mistakes?"

Mr. Mullick sought to counter her by stating that people now had the benefit of hindsight. Many people believed that after Independence India had adopted the wrong policy of becoming a socialist country with licences, permits and quotas. But it was a policy that was required at that time because there was no capital formation in the country.

Besides, the Soviet model appeared to be a very attractive one at that time. The American model was capitalistic and imperialistic - and India was just coming out of the imperialistic yoke then.

"You can say these things in hindsight, but we are learning from our mistakes. But I agree with you that we learn too slowly," Mr. Mullick added.

Priyasri Patodia proposed the vote of thanks, concluding it with a flourish in Bengali.

Happy Birthday



Suresh Goklaney
April 6



Kalpana Singhania
April 6



Shanta Chatterji
April 7



Ghyanshyam Sheth
April 7



Ramesh Dhir
April 10



Prof. Rohini
Chowgule
April 11

Spouses/Rotaryanns

- Vrishali Pispati
April 5
- Avan Gidwani
April 7
- Kokila Modi
April 7
- Mehroo Bali
April 9
- Vandana Singh
April 9
- Rachna Agarwal
April 11

THE FOUR-WAY TEST

Of the things we think, say or do

1. Is it the **TRUTH**?
2. Is it **FAIR** to all concerned?
3. Will it build **GOOD-WILL** and **BETTER FRIENDSHIPS**?
4. Will it be **BENEFICIAL** to all concerned?

Editorial Consultant: Anmol Purohit, Sajjan Sons, 203/204 Triveni, Mith Chowki, Marve Road, Malad (West), Mumbai 400 064. Cell: 09322227026; Home: 022-28880712. E-Mail: anmolsp@gmail.com

Regd. No. MH/MR/South-109/2009-11, R.N.I. No. 14015/60